UNITED
NATIONS

E

Economic and Social
Council

Distr.
GENERAL

E/CN.4/1998/101
13 January 1998

Original: ENGLISH

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS
Fifty-fourth session
Agenda item 20 of the provisional agenda

RIGHTS OF THE CHILD

Report of the Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, Ms. Ofelia Calcetas-Santos

CONTENTS

		Paragraphs	Page
Introduction		1 - 3	2
I.	WORKING METHODS AND ACTIVITIES	4 - 8	2
	A. Working methods	4 - 6	2
	B. Activities	7 - 8	3
II.	INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENTS RELATING TO SALE OF CHILDREN, CHILD PROSTITUTION AND CHILD PORNOGRAPHY	9 - 24	4
III.	SPECIAL FOCUS ON THE MEDIA AND EDUCATION	25 - 142	6
	A. International legal framework	29 - 38	7
	B. The role of the traditional media	39 - 73	9
	C. The media and the rights of the defendant	74 - 78	16
	D. New media	79 - 109	17
	E. Education as a catalyst	110 - 142	23
IV.	RECOMMENDATIONS	143 - 148	30
	A. The media and education	143 - 145	30
	B. Networking between governmental and non-governmental organizations	146 - 148	34

GE.98-10106 (E)

Introduction

1. At its fifty-third session, the Commission on Human Rights, in its resolution 1997/78 of 18 April 1997, welcomed the report of the Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography (E/CN.4/1997/95 and Add.1 and 2). In the same resolution, the Special Rapporteur was requested to submit an interim report to the General Assembly at its fifty-second session (A/52/482) and a report to the Commission on Human Rights at its fifty-fourth session.

2. The Commission, furthermore, called upon States to develop urgently, implement and enforce measures to eliminate the sale of children and their sexual exploitation, inter alia, through child sex tourism and other forms of child prostitution and child pornography, including measures in line with the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action and with those outlined in the Declaration and Agenda for Action of the World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children. It requested States to criminalize effectively commercial and all other forms of sexual exploitation of children, while ensuring that child victims are not penalized for such practices, and to prosecute offenders, whether local or foreign.

3. The Commission also called upon States to step up cooperation and concerted action by all relevant law-enforcement authorities and institutions with a view to combating the existence of a market that encourages such criminal practices against children and dismantling national and international networks trafficking in children. In this connection, the present report, submitted in accordance with resolution 1997/78, contains a review of recent national and international developments and initiatives taken since the Special Rapporteur's report to the Commission on Human Rights at its fifty-third session.

I. WORKING METHODS AND ACTIVITIES

A. Working methods

4. Over the last two years the Special Rapporteur has made the commercial sexual exploitation of children the main focus of her mandate. Having identified three catalysts which she believes to be instrumental in preventing or inciting sexual exploitation of children, she studied first the role of the justice system in this regard (see A/51/456 and E/CN.4/1997/95). This year, she has been similarly analysing the roles played by the media and education, including the rapidly developing Internet.

5. On 30 June 1997, the Special Rapporteur wrote to all Governments, relevant United Nations bodies and agencies, and intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations requesting relevant information and materials on media/communications and education related to commercial sexual exploitation of children. More specifically, she requested information in the following categories:

(a) Television programmes/publicity preventing/inciting sexual exploitation of children; national directives concerning specific target audiences, broadcasting hours and parental guidance;

(b) Advertising/publicity campaigns against sex tourism and commercial sexual exploitation of children (i.e. airport publicity, leaflets, posters, promotional articles);

(c) Coverage given to court cases by media (newspapers, TV and radio) involving commercial sexual exploitation of children (e.g. child pornography and the Internet; public debates on sanctions against sex offenders);

(d) School curricula: development of sex education programmes, including awareness-raising about the dangers of sexual exploitation and information on available support services; adult education programmes;

(e) Education/training programmes targeted at professionals working in strategic areas, including immigration personnel, law-enforcement officers, medical professionals and social workers;

(f) Rehabilitation and educational programmes/facilities/support services for both child victims of commercial sexual exploitation and sex offenders.

6. Earlier replies which were received from 3 Governments, 8 United Nations agencies and 13 organizations, and many of their comments, were included in the recent report submitted by the Special Rapporteur to the General Assembly (A/52/482). As a large proportion of the available information related to media, the main focus of that report concentrated on the roles of the media and the Internet. Since that report was presented, replies have been received from the Governments of Canada, China, Finland, Israel, Pakistan and Peru. The Council of Europe and the Organization of African Unity also provided information to the Special Rapporteur. Replies were also received from the World Health Organization (WHO) and the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC). The following non-governmental organizations have since provided the Special Rapporteur with information: All Pakistan Women's Federation; Centro de Estudios y Rehabilitacion Psicosocial (CERSON) (Chile); Childline (UK); International Federation of Social Workers (IFSW) (Norway), as well as the NGO Group for the Convention on the Rights of the Child/Sub-Group on Sexual Exploitation of Children (Switzerland). The comments from these replies are included in the present report.

B. Activities

7. Since the fifty-third session of the Commission on Human Rights, the Special Rapporteur has carried out two field missions. In August 1997, the Special Rapporteur visited Kenya (Nairobi, Mombasa and Malindi). The mission report is contained in document E/CN.4/1998/101/Add.1. In November 1997, the Special Rapporteur visited Mexico (Mexico City (D.F.), Xalapa and Puerto de Veracruz (Veracruz), Cancún (Quintana-Roo), Ciudad Juárez (Chihuahua) and Tijuana (Baja California)). The report of that mission is in document E/CN.4/1998/101/Add.2.

8. In October 1997, the Special Rapporteur was invited to address the Seventh Meeting of First Ladies of the Americas held in Panama on the topic of commercial sexual exploitation of children.

II. INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENTS RELATING TO SALE OF CHILDREN, CHILD PROSTITUTION AND CHILD PORNOGRAPHY

9. In New South Wales, Australia, two men recently committed suicide and a third was left brain damaged after failing in his attempt, after having been investigated by the New South Wales Child Protection Enforcement Agency in relation to allegations of child abuse. Computer records allegedly containing child pornography had been seized in raids upon homes in the area, and a juvenile had been taken from the care of one of the men. The dead men had recently been charged with child sex offences and had been granted bail. There have been a series of suicides recently by men in Australia who were under investigation for child abuse, including the case of a retired judge. 1/

10. In New Zealand, police authorities have developed a strategic policy to aid the prevention and detection of the commercial sexual exploitation of children. This has included active work by the national authorities to suppress the sexual exploitation and abuse of children, and addressing the problem of the Internet being used for child pornography.

11. In the United States of America, more than 40 States have now adopted versions of "Megan's Law", which requires that communities across America be informed when a convicted paedophile moves into the area. The law is named after a seven-year-old victim who was raped and murdered in 1994. The atrocious crime was committed by a twice-convicted paedophile who, together with two other convicted sex offenders, moved into a house almost opposite the home of his victim. The crime took place in a quiet suburban street, and created a feeling of insecurity in supposedly safe middle-class neighbourhoods. 2/

12. Also in the United States, the Roman Catholic Church of Dallas was ordered to pay US$ 119 million in damages for ignoring evidence and covering up the long-term sexual abuse of 11 altar boys by a priest. One of his victims later committed suicide allegedly as a result of the abuse. 3/

13. According to information received from a non-governmental organization providing services to street children, a growing number of "sex tourists" are visiting countries of Central America following the recent restrictions and operations against sex tourism in Asian countries. Extreme poverty and an insufficient judicial system lead paedophiles to believe that they can go to Central America and abuse children without any risk of legal accountability for their actions.

14. In Costa Rica, a Swiss man and a German woman were jailed for four years in May 1997 for operating a brothel where minors were employed. In San José two Americans were arrested in September for operating a "sex tourism" operation in which foreign visitors were collected at the airport and taken straight to a brothel in the capital, where they had sex with minors.

15. The Special Rapporteur was particularly concerned to receive allegations that over 30,000 children in the Dominican Republic work as prostitutes to escape poverty. 4/ Most of these children no longer live with their parents, but have either been thrown out or prefer to work on the streets to earn a

living for themselves or their parents. Minors who engage in this trade are common in Santo Domingo and other tourist zones such as Boca Chica and Puerto Plata.

16. It has also been reported that recently a paedophile was arrested in Florida accused of trafficking a young Honduran boy to the United States. The accused, described as one of the most sought-after criminals, with 85 charges of paedophilia against him, was arrested in Honduras by Interpol. However, the local laws of Honduras often fail to effectively protect children. Most offences against children are considered private crimes and authorities cannot intervene without a complaint having been filed by the child or the parents.

17. Also in Honduras, the Special Rapporteur is informed that a Guatemalan woman was recently sentenced to two years and eight months for attempting to transport five juveniles across the border from Honduras to Guatemala.

18. In the United Kingdom, following recent developments, courts are to be given new powers to ban paedophiles from playgrounds, school entrances, and other public places frequented by children. This will be achieved through the granting of a community protection order which will prohibit convicted sex offenders from specified areas where they may be liable to re-offend. Sex offenders who have been released from jail since 1 September 1997, are required to register their addresses with police. 5/

19. The Government of Norway, together with the International Labour Organization and UNICEF, hosted a 40-nation ministerial conference on child labour in Oslo from 27 to 30 October 1997. The participants agreed that prostitution and pornography, along with the persistent exploitation of children in slave-like and bonded conditions in hazardous and arduous work, constitute the most intolerable forms of child labour, with as many as 250 million young victims worldwide. The primary importance of legislation to achieve the global elimination of child labour was considered alongside the need for education, social mobilization and development cooperation.

20. Germany has launched a new drive against child abuse, child pornography and sex tourism, combining tougher sentencing with preventive educational schemes. The Ministry of Youth has launched educational films, comics and pamphlets for children and parents and intends to increase the number of telephone hotlines. More funds are to be allocated for training teachers, police officers, lawyers, medical personnel and tour guides to raise awareness of the problems of child sex abuse. It is estimated that approximately 200,000 German men travel abroad each year to have sex, often seeking young teenage girls. It has also been reported that German sex agencies advertise underage Russian girls. Some German aid money is directed at supporting training for children in countries like Thailand to prevent them from resorting to prostitution. 6/

21. Following the arrest at Milan airport of a couple posing as Japanese tourists with a young daughter, Italian investigators recently claimed to have broken an international paedophile ring in which children were smuggled from East Asia to the United States. The 12-year-old child was allegedly sold by her parents in China for approximately US$ 58,000 and was being trafficked to the United States. The investigators believed that there is a

Japanese-organized group which allegedly sends Chinese children to the United States for prostitution and paedophilia. The girl revealed that whilst in Bangkok she saw approximately 15 other young children in the same situation as herself. 7/

22. Italy has a new law which classifies the sexual exploitation of children as slavery, imposing a 12-year prison sentence. Parliament is currently discussing a new bill to increase sentences for sexual exploitation of children or the organization of sex tourism, to be applicable also to Italians abusing children abroad. The bill, known as the "Promotion of the Rights and Opportunities for Childhood and Adolescence Bill" foresees harsh sentences for people producing and/or disseminating material using children through the Internet. It also intends to provide psychological help for the children suffering abuse, as well as the perpetrators. 8/

23. France recently conducted one of the largest investigations against a paedophile ring anywhere in recent history. About 2,500 policemen were fielded to search about 800 homes throughout France after the beginning of the trial in Paris of 71 French men accused of organizing or subscribing to a paedophile video network involving young boys. Within a week there were 323 persons under investigation. Five of these men committed suicide rather than face investigation and trial. 9/

24. The Russian Federation is witnessing what has been described as an "epidemic" of street children, known as the besprizorniki, or neglected ones. According to United Nations estimates, 4 in 10 Russian children live in poverty, and there are perhaps as many as 6,000 vagrant children in Moscow. Social and familial instability have contributed to the growing number of runaway, homeless, orphaned or abused children, including migrants from former Soviet republics. For some, the only escape from the drudgery of life on the streets is through sniffing glue or drinking vodka. The cost of such addictions almost inevitably lead to a life of crime and prostitution. 10/

III. SPECIAL FOCUS ON THE MEDIA AND EDUCATION

25. In her recent report to the General Assembly (A/52/482), the Special Rapporteur stressed the positive role played by the media and education in the prevention of commercial sexual exploitation of children worldwide. At the same time, she highlighted the potential dangers that exist that may add to the vulnerability of children and increase the risk of their being sexually exploited. She devoted particular attention to the implications of the Internet in this regard. In the report, she reiterated her request for further information on the role of education, and would like to take this opportunity to thank all those who responded to her request, enabling her to provide a more balanced analysis of the two catalysts in the present report.

26. Many facets of the media and education overlap and to a certain extent the two could be considered as one instrument for the purpose of general awareness-raising. In this regard, although they will be considered separately, the Special Rapporteur would again emphasize the importance of the role played by the media as a tool of general education, both for children and adults, especially in the protection of the rights of children. In the

sections below, the Special Rapporteur has included new information received on the media and education; some references were already included in her report to the General Assembly.

27. The Special Rapporteur would like to lay out, in broadest terms, the international legal framework that regulates the protection of children from commercial sexual exploitation but yet guarantees the rights of children to education and information. At the same time, it is important to note that the right of children to be protected from exploitation may at times appear to contend with the right of the communications media to express themselves and disseminate information freely.

28. The right to freedom of expression is given extensive protection in most democracies, although it is subject to considerable debate and interpretation as to its scope, meaning and purpose. The rights of the media to publish and broadcast information, however, and the rights of the audiences to receive information have to be carefully balanced against the rights of the child to be protected from abuse or from further abuse, and of the child's right to privacy. Furthermore, recent cases involving the rights of suspected and convicted paedophiles have also created much controversy and discussion in certain countries.

A. International legal framework

29. This section, therefore, purports to outline those human rights intended to protect the child from falling victim to commercial sexual exploitation, including the right of the child to receive information and education. The right of all persons, including children, to be informed and educated, as well as the right of all persons to impart and disseminate information are also of relevance when considering the impact of media and education on commercial sexual exploitation of children.

30. Under the Convention on the Rights of the Child, children are, broadly speaking, endowed with the rights to respect and identity (articles 2, 7, 8, 23, 26 and 40), as well as with rights to economic, social and cultural development (articles 6 and 24). States parties to the Convention have also undertaken to protect such rights of the child by creating and strengthening a protective environment (articles 3, 9, 11, 16, 19-22, 24, 25, 30 and 32-38) and by promoting a caring environment (articles 18, 23, 24, 26, 31 and 39). All these groups of rights contained in the Convention are directly or indirectly relevant to the protection of the child from sexual exploitation.

31. More specifically, under articles 19 and 34, States parties undertake to protect the child from all forms of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse, taking all appropriate measures to prevent the inducement of children to engage in any unlawful sexual activity, the exploitative use of children in prostitution or other unlawful sexual practices and the exploitative use of children in pornographic performances and materials.

32. In addition to providing for protection from the physical act of sexual exploitation, the Convention prohibits arbitrary or unlawful interference with

a child's privacy or unlawful attacks on his or her honour and reputation, and gives the child the right to the protection of the law against such interference or attacks (article 16).

33. While all States parties to the Convention have agreed to protect the child from becoming a victim of sexual exploitation, several provisions of the Convention recognize that education and the media play an important role in preventing such violations by empowering children through information and education.

34. One of the key provisions in this context is article 17, under which States parties recognize the important function performed by the mass media and shall ensure that the child has access to information and material from a diversity of national and international sources, especially those aimed at the promotion of his or her social, spiritual and moral well-being and physical and mental health. Article 13, moreover, provides for the child's right to freedom of expression, including the freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any other media of the child's choice. This right may, however, be subject to certain restrictions, as provided by law and as are necessary for respect of the rights or reputations of others or for the protection of, inter alia, public morals. Under articles 28 and 29, children have the right to education and educational and vocational information, directed to the development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential.

35. Throughout the Convention, the best interest of the child is the underlying principle - a principle which necessitates a careful balance between the rights and freedoms of the child and the responsibility of parents, guardians and society as a whole to protect the child and to ensure his or her upbringing and development and physical, mental and moral integrity.

36. All persons disseminating information through the media and education, while endowed with rights and freedoms freely to express themselves and to seek, receive and impart information in accordance with article 19 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, are also bound to respect the right of privacy of children victims of commercial sexual exploitation under article 17 of that Covenant. The aforementioned article 19 provides that the exercise of the right to freedom of expression carries with it special duties and responsibilities and may be subject to such restrictions as are provided by law and are necessary for the respect of the rights or reputation of others and for the protection of, inter alia, public morals. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights when providing for the right of everyone to education, emphasizes that such education should be directed to the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity and towards strengthening the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms.

37. A dilemma already mentioned is the protection of the right to privacy of child sex offenders, which has been widely debated in some countries, where civil liberties defenders are at odds with those who argue that such rights may be limited or restricted if necessary for the protection of public morals.

38. Another issue posing legal challenges for protecting the rights of the child is the definition of child pornography. The Special Rapporteur has already addressed this issue (see E/CN.4/1997/95/Add.2), arguing that the Internet renders the traditional legal definition of child pornography, namely the visual depiction or use of a child for pornographic purposes, outdated. The Special Rapporteur, therefore, encourages the Committee on the Rights of the Child to reaffirm that the scope of article 34 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child should be interpreted to include an absolute prohibition on "pseudo-child pornography", including the "morphing" of child and adult bodies to create virtual child pornographic images.

B. The role of the traditional media

39. The media are the most powerful tool of mass communication nationally and internationally, and their potential to protect children from sexual abuse and exploitation should be explored thoroughly. Media have many facets, and as such can reach a wide and varied audience. Some of the most prominent facets of the media and their abilities to impact both positively and negatively upon the lives of those involved in all the different aspects of sexual exploitation were examined in the report to the General Assembly.

40. The Committee on the Rights of the Child, during its discussions on the issue of "the child and the media", on 7 October 1996, expressed the view that the press and other media have essential functions in promoting and protecting the fundamental rights of the child and in helping to make reality of the principles and standards of the Convention on the Rights of the Child.

41. As a result of their deliberations the Committee identified three main areas to be considered in this context:

(a) Child participation in the media;

(b) Protection of the child against harmful influences through the media;

(c) Respect for the integrity of the child in media reporting.

42. The Special Rapporteur feels that this approach provides a useful method in which to consider both the roles of the various facets of the media, and how different national and international bodies are tackling the effects of these facets upon the education and protection of children. It is for these reasons, and in order to provide information and analysis in line with the Committee's recommendations, that the Special Rapporteur has decided to conduct her analysis following this structure.

1. The participation of children in the media

43. Article 13 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child provides for the right to freedom of expression of the child and refers to his or her right to do this "through any media of the child's choice". The media is one of the strongest influences upon the self-image of a child and upon the image which is portrayed to society in general. Consequently, that image can either create and convey respect for children and young people, or spread prejudices

and stereotypes which may have a negative effect on public opinion. The child's participation in this process is, therefore, vital, but must take place in such a way as to ensure the avoidance of exploitation of the child participant whilst resulting in a positive effect upon the whole range of viewers, children and adults alike.

44. In this context, concerns have been raised as a result of several visual productions in different parts of the world. In the United Kingdom, a drama documentary entitled "No Child of Mine" was screened, portraying a 10-year-old victim of repeated sexual abuse. The documentary was commended for bringing the subject into the public arena, but concerns were expressed for the psychological well-being of the 13-year-old actress who portrayed the victim, as she had to act out graphic scenes of rape. Concerns were also expressed that the film might become soft-porn material for paedophiles, and that the use of a child actor by the mainstream media could be regarded as a societal validation of their sexual misconduct.

45. Similar fears about the "soft porn" label being given to mainstream material were raised in regard to a controversial movie entitled "Kids", which was banned from general release in the United States of America in 1996, as it graphically depicted promiscuous under-age sex and drug-taking.

46. Such films can make a positive contribution to the raising of public awareness about the extent of forced or consensual under-age sexual activity and highlight the damage which can result therefrom, but care must be taken to avoid creating a new "genre" of such drama-documentaries, posing the risk that audiences will become desensitized to the real horrors of paedophilia and child sex.

47. Another area where child participation needs to be carefully considered and regulated is the use of children as fashion models, in catalogues and on the catwalk. The use of teenage girls, some as young as 13, modelling adult fashions may create the impression that thin pre-pubescent bodies are the most sexually desirable. This not only puts immense pressure on women of all ages to achieve unnatural and unhealthy body shapes and sizes, but more importantly, creates legitimacy in the eyes of the paedophile that his desires are "normal", especially as the children are encouraged to look and behave like adults in front of the camera. The children involved are given the message that adults agree with the idea of them being sexualized, and other children who view the photos are misled into believing that this is a desirable way to be portrayed.

48. Images of children as sexual objects are also used extensively by advertisers to sell almost anything from food to perfume and cars. Whilst many advertisers are careful to portray children as children, others have stepped over the boundaries and used children in provocative poses. Calvin Klein recently yielded to pressure and removed its advertisement campaign showing teenagers in "suggestive" poses. In Finland, the Consumer Ombudsman has intervened in some cases involving marketing which have been interpreted as contravening the Consumer Protection Act, according to which no method contrary to good practice or which is otherwise unfair from the point

of view of the consumers shall be used in marketing. In accordance with this, "sexually objectifying" advertising in the papers has been abandoned in some cases.

49. Even where the advertisers have used children in a more "innocent" way, the opportunity of future exploitation has inadvertently been created. Photographs of children in their underwear for mail order catalogues are an easily accessible source of material for paedophiles, and are commonly used as such, as has been revealed by the discoveries of extensive paedophilia collections during police raids on suspects' homes.

50. Members of the British Association of Photographers who work in advertising, fashion and publishing took part in a conference entitled "Child Exploitation and the Media Forum" which was organized as part of the response of the United Kingdom to the Stockholm Congress. The Association proposed the development of a code of practice governing the use of child models, but acknowledged that there is a danger of taking away some of the children's innocence by over-regulating their participation. However, they proposed some useful guidelines to alert professionals and parents to the potential dangers. These include the following:

(a) Photographers should avoid taking pictures of children in their underwear;

(b) No child should ever go on a photographic shoot without a chaperone and the chaperone should remain in the same room as the child at all times;

(c) Strict guidelines must be enforced as to the length of time children in different age groups may work and be kept waiting on location;

(d) Parents must be educated as to what constitutes acceptable modelling activities. Too many parents are so keen to get their children photographed that they ignore the potential dangers of the situations in which their children are placed.

2. Protection of children against harmful influences through the media

51. Protection of children from the harmful influences of the media involves two elements. The potential for direct harm to the child as viewer of the material must be considered, as well as the less direct but equally dangerous impact upon the behaviour of adults towards children, when they are repeatedly exposed to material which "normalizes" juvenile sexual activity.

52. This raises the question of what can objectively be considered a harmful influence. During the discussion day of the Committee on the Rights of the Child, participants felt that the need for a clear identification of "harmful influences" in the media was essential but would be no easy task, given the ambivalent nature of many facets of the media.

53. Since the early 1990s, children in Europe have in principle been protected against exposure to gratuitous violence on television by the

European Convention on Transfrontier Television and the EU Television without Frontiers Directive. More recently, new developments in the media, and events such as the paedophile murders in Belgium, which revealed the use of the Internet to disseminate child pornography, have increased political pressure to take additional measures to protect minors against abuse and exposure to media content which could be considered harmful to their development.

54. In April 1997, the European Parliament and the Council of Ministers reached an agreement on some controversial issues, among these the so-called "V-chip" amendment proposed by the Parliament. If accepted, this amendment would have required broadcasters to encode all their programmes on the basis of a common classification system and every television would have had to be fitted with a mechanism enabling parents to filter out certain programmes. However, this legislation was considered premature and the Parliament settled for a text urging the Commission to carry out an investigation into the possible advantages and disadvantages of such measures. The European Parliament's proposal that programmes that are likely to impair the physical, mental or moral development of minors should be preceded by an acoustic warning or identified by a visual symbol throughout their duration was accepted by the Council.

55. In the United States of America, a new system of television ratings referred to as "The TV Parental Guidelines" has been widely criticized by child advocacy groups who argue for a non-judgemental rating system which would indicate the content of the individual programmes rather than making a recommendation on the age of the child who should see it. Research carried out by the American organization Mediascope on behalf of the National Television Violence Study found that where children saw a rating entitled "PG-13: Parents Strongly Cautioned", and "R: Restricted", they were more eager to see the movie than when it was given a content label such as "mild violence" or "graphic violence".

56. The European Commission has repeatedly emphasized the need to distinguish between illegal material, such as child pornography, and other types of content, such as ordinary pornography or material containing violence which is legal but may be harmful to children. Illegal material falls under existing laws and can be punished accordingly, but with regard to legal but possibly harmful material, the Commission points out that the rules in the EU member States vary greatly and reflect different cultural and moral standards.

57. The protection of minors with regard to media content has also been discussed in the EU Economic and Social Committee. In February 1996, the Committee issued an "opinion" calling for a European cultural policy for children (CES250/96), in which it wrote that it was "appalled by the increasing violence and bad language on television affecting children's perception and development". It urged member States to encourage television companies to show quality programmes and to create State institutions charged with evaluating and rewarding excellence in children's television.

58. In Eastern Europe, three days of informal talks in Slovakia among children's media professionals resulted in the Bratislava Resolution of 1994. The International Centre of Films for Children and Young People (CIFEJ) had

invited heads of children's programming from Eastern European television stations to meet and find ways of dealing with the falling standards of quality programmes for children following the formation of the new democracies. Through all the discussions, participants agreed on many issues, including that:

(a) Small children need to hear stories told in their own languages, reflecting people they know in places that look like home. This builds a sense of identity and comfort;

(b) Children should be protected from images of certain kinds of violence and abuse which are becoming increasingly common in Eastern European productions;

(c) Children should not be treated merely as consumers; a captive audience to whom to sell things.

59. The concerns over the potential for harm from the various facets of the media generally revolve around visual entertainment, namely television, cinema and, now, the Internet. However, regrettably, some communication media have been utilized not only in positive but also in negative ways.

60. One such medium is the telephone. Helplines and hotlines allow victims to talk about their abuse, or reluctant witnesses to report what they have seen without the emotional strain of a face-to-face meeting. Sometimes famous television personalities have initiated, or have been used to publicize these special lines. In the United Kingdom, a well-known television presenter launched "Childline" through her programme "That's Life", thereby speaking to a ready-made huge audience. The programme had previously appealed to viewers for their help in conducting a survey on child abuse, and the British Broadcasting Corporation then ran a telephone helpline for 24 hours after the programme for adults and children who wished to call. A special permanent free telephone helpline was then established which now, over 10 years later, provides counselling for an estimated 90,000 children and young people every year. It offers children a free and confidential opportunity to speak about their problems. They can remain anonymous if they choose, and are not asked to name their abusers. The special Childline number is now widely publicized through various means; most recently the number has been printed on the back of bus and cinema tickets.

61. Negatively, however, the telephone has been used to contribute to the sexual exploitation of children, such as through the so-called "dial-a-porn" or phone sex services. These services offer sexually explicit messages, live or pre-recorded, for a fee over telephone lines. The services emerged in the 1980s and in several countries, such as the United States and Japan, became a large industry. Many parents in these countries were surprised by dramatic increases in their telephone bills, and then shocked to discover how easily their children could access these services.

62. The United States responded with Congress passing specific legislation that criminalized certain dial-a-porn activities. For example, the Telecommunications Act was amended to prohibit dissemination of obscene or indecent commercial telephone services in interstate or foreign communications

to persons under 18 years of age. Subsequently, the Federal Communications Commission determined that dial-a-porn providers would only be able to conduct business between the hours of 9.00 p.m. and 8.00 a.m. or must receive payment by credit card before transmitting an adult message. Since 1983, legislative, executive and judicial bodies of the United States Government have developed a series of regulations and legislation, seeking a constitutionally acceptable solution.

63. By contrast, in Japan, once the telephone industry and the Government had concluded that action was necessary, they responded by developing a system of self-regulation. Voluntary self-regulation has been commonly used in Japan to control sexual expression in media such as movies, videos and computer games. Other States which have successfully avoided regulatory measures through similarly promoting self-regulation in the relevant industries have achieved a modicum of success in their striving to achieve a balance between upholding the right to freedom of expression whilst protecting the right to privacy.

64. Self-regulation by the media should not be promoted as the only possible way forward. All sectors of society, from broadcasters to teachers, parents and children, need to be educated as to how to deal with the media in a critical and constructive manner. Media professionals need to become familiar with the Convention on the Rights of the Child and to draft or amend guidelines for the media in the light thereof. While the implementation of such guidelines should be carried out by media professionals, citizens' associations and consumer groups should be empowered to monitor the content of media programmes and scheduling times.

65. School and other youth forums should be used to raise children's awareness of how to handle media issues and to explore the role of the media as a forum for children to express themselves.

3. Respect for the integrity of the child in media reporting

66. The media play an essential role in the promotion and protection of human rights in general and media professionals, including editors and owners, should be particularly vigilant in trying to safeguard the integrity of the child. The working group of the Committee on the Rights of the Child on the child and the media has focused its deliberations on two main issues:

(a) The way in which the media should approach children;

(b) The child's access to the media.

(a) The way in which the media should approach the child

67. Firstly, consideration is given to the way in which the media as sources of information should approach children. Of equal importance is the manner in which that information is processed. The value of the child victim as provider of a good story is indisputable, and the media spotlight raises awareness and often stimulates viewers to make financial contributions in an attempt to somehow alleviate the child's suffering, which in turn might provide the money to establish or expand existing support programmes for

children. However, all too often child victims and the members of their families can be significantly hurt by the process of being the focus of media attention.

68. One area where extreme care must be taken is in the reporting of sexual offences. This can have a devastating impact upon the lives of those involved. Reporters may unwittingly compound existing problems of sexual exploitation and further a victim's distress by the insensitivity of their actions. At the same time, journalists who act with sensitivity and concern for the victims on whom they report can do much to further the healing process when the pain and anguish that has been suffered is publicly acknowledged and efforts to restore the victim's dignity are made. In all such situations, whether it involves interviews, simulations or reporting of events such as sexual abuse, paramount consideration must be given to the best interests of the child involved and the protection of his or her privacy.

69. Where criminal proceedings are initiated, the way in which the press reports the events can affect the outcome of the trial. There have been many instances of so-called "trial by media" where criminal proceedings have had to be abandoned as the guarantee of a fair trial could not be ensured due to the prejudgemental nature of the press reports. This not only denies the victim the satisfaction of a public acknowledgment of his or her suffering coupled with an opportunity to see the abuser sentenced, but also denies the accused the opportunity to defend himself against the allegations made, in a properly constituted legal setting. Similarly, there have been cases where journalists have unwittingly corrupted evidence by paying for stories, enabling criminals to escape conviction on a technicality.

70. The potential of the press to affect public perceptions of crimes involving sexual abuse is not limited to the subject matter involved, but extends to the manner in which it is reported. Many reporters appear to place the blame upon women and girls when sexually degrading events or crimes occur. Reports of violent rapes lose their ability to arouse emotions of outrage and sympathy for the victims when set alongside photographs of the victim which could be interpreted as sexually provocative, or even when they appear in the same newspaper as pictures of topless women. The media in some countries often appear to "confuse" victims with perpetrators by publishing pictures of children who have been sexually exploited and blanking out the faces of offenders.

(b) The child's access to the media

71. The need to protect children from the potentially harmful influences of certain aspects of the media must not overshadow the importance of including children within the media forum. Children's participation means children consenting to be the sources or subjects of reports, to be the storytellers or actors themselves, and to make the decision whether or not to participate. Children must be provided with an appropriate channel of expression in order properly to contribute to raising awareness of human rights violations suffered by children; their active participation means that they understand the issues surrounding the particular subject that they are involved with,

rather than merely being the passive recipients of knowledge. The fact must be recognized that children are best placed to communicate their own needs, while not losing sight of the notion that the child's competence to express itself and to make judgements is a developing ability.

72. One area in which child participation in the media process is being encouraged is with the reporting of child labour issues. In the Philippines, the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) of the ILO programme has been searching for ways to become more actively involved in promoting children's rights to participation in the media and in decision-making with respect to issues affecting their lives. Children's participation has included the use of the talents of actual working children during location shootings, consultations with the children concerning the purpose of the production and the approach that should be followed, as well as eliciting information from them about the work that they do.

73. In Nairobi, a children's theatre group has grown from a group of around 25 actors and actresses into a community of over 100 former street children. "Shangilia Mtoto wa Africa" ("Rejoice Child of Africa") is an awareness-raising and direct action organization which uses theatre productions performed by children to expose the rising predicament of street children and child labour issues. Since the first public performance in Nairobi in 1994, the theatre group has generated widespread publicity and strong interest and has toured throughout Kenya and abroad. The children are provided with informal schooling, food, accommodation and medical care and, through their involvement with the theatre, a sense of confidence and social achievement. The targets of the theatre productions are other street children, adult policy makers, parents, non-governmental organizations, and the general public through broadcasting, church congregations and schools.

C. The media and the rights of the defendant

74. In concluding the analysis of the role of the media, the rights of defendants or those implicated in child sex crimes must be considered. Although sympathies rarely lie with those associated with such crimes, the Special Rapporteur has been very concerned to note the number of recent suicides as a result of investigations into allegations of child sexual abuse. These have occurred notably in France and to a lesser extent Australia, and resulted in criticism of the intense media coverage of the recent widespread investigations into paedophilia in those countries. The majority of the suicides occurred prior to trial. In that context, the Special Rapporteur would reiterate that it is of paramount importance to ensure that any such trial is fair, and that it is so perceived by the defendant. Presumption of innocence must prevail even for the most heinous crimes.

75. In a similar vein, controversy continues in several countries as to the most acceptable method of ensuring a balance between the rights of convicted sex offenders who have served their sentence and have been released, and the protection of the children in the neighbourhood in which the offender intends to live.

76. In the United States, neighbours of seven-year-old Megan Kanka were outraged to hear that her killer had two previous sex convictions before he

moved into the house across the street from his victim. Megan's mother led a campaign for laws requiring that neighbours be notified when released sex criminals move into an area. As already mentioned above, adaptations of "Megan's law" were passed in New Jersey and other states. In all 50 states, a paroled sex offender must register his residency with local authorities, and all but five states require some form of notification when a convicted sex offender moves into a neighbourhood.

77. In the United Kingdom, the Government is considering more effective ways of supervising sex offenders when they are released from prison, and is in the process of setting up a national register of paedophiles. The number of sexual offenders is unknown but is estimated to be 110,000, most of them men. The Government has so far resisted pressure from child rights groups and concerned parents to legislate in favour of community notification of the whereabouts of convicted offenders.

78. Although the Special Rapporteur can understand the concerns of those who want to be informed about potential threats to their children, she feels that great caution must be exercised where States consider passing legislation to reveal the identities of convicted offenders to the general public. Such revelations would result in the local community taking the law into their own hands and dispensing their own, perhaps violent measures of justice. As a result, the offenders would be unable to establish a permanent place of residence, which would make it very difficult for the authorities who should always be informed of their identities to monitor their activities.

D. New media

79. In her report to the General Assembly (A/52/482), the Special Rapporteur analysed the role of new technologies in the commercial sexual exploitation of children and summarized the main developments and dangers which have arisen as a result of their rapid growth. Whilst most sectors of society are still grappling to understand the basics of how the Internet works, many bodies are organizing themselves into forums to consider the best ways to tackle some of the novel problems which have developed with the rise of the Internet.

80. In this chapter, the Special Rapporteur will summarize the impact of the Internet upon the commercial sexual exploitation of children, and at the same time consider some of the initiatives which have been taken, nationally and internationally, and suggestions that have been made in relation to how the problems might be resolved.

1. Children and the Internet

81. The Internet is a decentralized, global medium of communication that links people, institutions, corporations and Governments around the world. The computer networks are owned by governmental and public institutions, non-profit organizations and private corporations. No single entity, academic or governmental, corporate or non-profit, administers the Internet. There is no central point at which all the information is stored or from which it is disseminated, and it would not be technically feasible for any one entity to control all of the information conveyed on the Internet.

82. Whilst the Special Rapporteur recognizes and commends the educational value of the wealth of information available on the Internet, she expresses concern at the many ways in which children might be exposed to danger online. The two main ways in which children can be potentially harmed by child pornography are by being filmed/photographed or made the subject of the pornographic material in some other way, or by being exposed to such material as a viewer.

2. The child as the subject of pornography

83. The advances in computer technology, including the use of camcorders, video recorders, home editing desks, and computer-generated graphics and editing, have made the creation and distribution of child pornography easier, cheaper and more difficult to detect. It has developed into a multi-million-dollar industry which can be run from within the exploiter's home. The Internet can be used by paedophiles to contact each other and they can set up bulletin boards to exchange information relating to their sexual interest in children, or have running conversations in the form of "chat rooms" on such subjects.

84. Every photo or videotape of child pornography is evidence of that child's abuse. The distribution of that depiction repeats the victimization over and over again, long after the original material was created. The suicide of a 12-year-old victim of sexual abuse in Upper Austria, appears to have resulted not only from the trauma of the abuse, but following his discovery of photographs of his abuse on the Internet.

85. Images can be altered by computer. It is not difficult to add or delete objects or parts of a photo to or from an image, thereby creating pseudo-photos. A child's face can be superimposed on an adult's body, and adult features such as breasts and genitals can be minimized so as to make the images look like children. The distribution of the altered image is still considered to exploit the child whose face is shown. It is also possible to insert digital images of a person into a video in which they have not appeared.

86. Lifelike child pornography is now being created without using any real children at all, and an unusual case in Canada in 1993 involved the conviction of a man who had posted on the Internet images depicting him having sex with female children, although he had never photographed or filmed actual children or manipulated images to create pseudo-photos. Under Canadian law, child pornography includes not only materials involving real children, but those conveying the impression of children involved in sex or advocating sex with a child under the age of 18. One of the ideas behind the law was that the harm caused by child pornography extends beyond the direct abuse of children in its production, and such material has great potential to promote child sexual abuse whether or not the child portrayed is a real person.

3. The child as viewer of sexually explicit material on the Internet

87. Material on the Internet which is described as "sexually explicit" includes text, pictures, and chat between users. It includes bulletin boards, newsgroups and other forms of Internet communication, and runs the gamut from

mildly titillating to hard-core pornography. Although surveys suggest that pornographic sites are among those most often visited on the Internet, the number of such sites is uncertain. Once a provider posts material on the Internet, it is available to all other Internet users worldwide, and the provider cannot prevent that content from entering any community. The Internet technology gives everyone a potentially worldwide audience, although almost all sexually explicit images are preceded by warnings as to the content.

88. Many of the concerns of those who seek to limit the propagation of harmful or obscene material through this medium were raised at a seminar held at the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights in Geneva from 10 to 14 November 1997, to consider the problem of racist propaganda over the Internet. Experts on the technical and legal aspects of the Internet participated in the seminar along with representatives of Governments, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, human rights institutes and United Nations agencies. Although the material under consideration, namely hate speech and racism, raised different issues as far as the relevant legislation was concerned, many points analogous to the problem of pornography and child pornography on the Internet were considered, especially those which related to technological matters.

89. Although child pornography should never be legal and, therefore, should, in theory, not come into conflict with freedom of expression, such conflict does arise over racist speech and with regard to adult pornography being viewed by minors. The concern was raised during the seminar that if any steps were to be taken to regulate the Internet, it must be ensured that States would not use their power to control the Internet to further their political purposes while abusing the fundamental right of citizens to speak freely.

90. In this connection, during the General Assembly at its fifty-second session, the Special Rapporteur was very encouraged to hear that Canada, in follow-up to the Stockholm Conference, will be sponsoring a conference on human rights and the Internet, to draw together work being done in many international forums, with a focus on strategies for using the Internet to increase respect for human rights, especially the rights of the child.

(a) Restricting access to unwanted online material

91. Two possible ways of preventing child pornography from being posted on the Internet are through the legal system and through self-regulating initiatives. As the development of the Internet is still in its infancy, Governments which have attempted to regulate its use have often not fully understood either the technology or the implications of their actions to control it. Self-regulating initiatives, which give the users of the Internet some responsibility over what should be removed, have made some progress towards removing the conflict between regulation and freedom of expression.

(b) Parental regulation

92. There is no way to determine conclusively the identity or age of a user who is accessing material through the Internet. An e-mail address may be an "alias" or use an anonymous re-mailer. There is also no universal listing

identifying the holders of e-mail addresses, and any such listing would rapidly be out of date. There is, therefore, no way for a sender to know whether an e-mail recipient is an adult or a minor. Similarly, even individuals engaging in chat room discussions cannot ensure that all readers are adults.

93. Various manufacturers have begun to build systems and have marketed software intended to enable parents to control the material which comes into their homes and may be accessed by their children, thereby allowing them to enjoy the educational benefits of the Internet while shielding them from objectionable material based on the parents' own standards.

94. Some software manufacturers have started to employ people to search the Internet for sites containing potentially offensive material, which they then add to a list every week. For those users who have the relevant software installed, the updated elements are automatically added to the list of previously blocked sites.

95. Other types of programs allow parents to monitor everything passing through their computer. Parents can enter such phrases as "What's your name?" and "What's your phone number?" in a phrase book. When the software detects one of the targeted phrases printing across the terminal, for example in a chat room of a commercial online service, it immediately logs off the service. To the extent that it is possible using the available technology to block access for children to certain newsgroups or chat rooms, there is no method by which the creators of newsgroups which contain discussions of normally acceptable subjects such as art or politics, but which could potentially elicit "indecent" contributions, can block access by minors to the "indecent" element only, whilst still allowing them access to the remaining content. Even security systems such as credit card verification or adult password verification are unlikely to develop to such an extent as to be able to ensure with certainty that the user of the password or credit card is over 18.

96. Therefore, all speech on any topic that is available to adults will also be available to children using the Internet, unless it is blocked by screening software running on the computer the child is using. There is no way that a speaker can use current technology to know if a listener is using screening software.

97. The attempts by the developers of software programs to regulate children's access to pornography, although very welcome, cannot achieve more than very limited success as these programs can be bypassed by users with a good knowledge of the Internet and some technical sophistication. Even if better technical solutions become available, this approach is inadequate because children can increasingly find access to another computer, and their technical expertise is often far superior to that of their parents.

(c) Self-regulation

98. The establishment of a code of conduct for service providers and users has been considered by some countries as a measure to allow self-regulation of the Internet and prevent the transmission of controversial material. In Australia, the Australian Broadcasting Authority, a statutory body, has

produced a report supporting a code of conduct established by private industry, subject to registration with a public authority. The report states that "the ABA recommends that industry codes of practice be developed by online service providers", infringement of which would lead to a public hearing. The ABA is also of the view that it should have a monitoring role in relation to codes of practice for service providers.

99. In the Netherlands, the "Hotline for Child Pornography on Internet" was created by the Dutch Foundation for Internet Providers (NLIP), Dutch Internet users, the National Criminal Intelligence Service (CRI), the National Bureau against Racial Discrimination and a psychologist. Like other national hotlines that are being set up in several countries, it operates by asking Internet users to report any child pornography that they find. The Netherlands Hotline tries to have a preventative attitude towards the problem, in that once a site is reported, the Website provider will ask the issuer of the material (if traceable) to remove it from the Internet, and will report that person to the police if he or she fails to do so.

100. The hotline has also operated to raise awareness of the risks of spreading child pornography, including that the penalty in the Netherlands is four years' imprisonment. Much attention has been given to the hotline by the media, thus further stimulating the process of awareness and prevention. Instead of being a censor, such hotlines are intended to be regarded as initiatives against censorship by indirectly targeting the poster of illegal child pornography instead of whole areas of information and communication. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the introduction of such initiatives, and would encourage States that have not yet considered the advantages of introducing such hotlines to explore fully the possibility of emulating this concept. She does, however, recognize that such methods of self-regulation rely heavily upon the willingness of those who use the Internet to take the responsibility upon themselves to be involved in the reporting of illegal material, rather than passively viewing whatever appears upon their screens. For this reason the arguments in favour of some degree of governmental regulation will continue to win a measure of support from some States, whilst others strongly oppose it.

(d) Governmental regulation

101. The anonymity which the Internet provides is its most important asset to those users who seek to access sensitive information. As such, it generates much support both in favour of and against governmental attempts to curtail its effects. A user can invent virtually any identity and route a message through different countries so that on reaching its destination, it would be impossible to determine the origin. It is also possible to re-route e-mail and images through what are referred to as "anonymous re-mailers". These take incoming messages and remove the source address, assign an anonymous identification code number with the re-mailer's address, and forward them to the final destination. Responses to the anonymous messages are then similarly encoded and the responder also remains anonymous. In Finland, one such re-mailer service was voluntarily closed down by the operator after having been accused of paedophilia, which the operator strongly denied. An adverse reaction to the close-down was expressed by the British organization "The

Samaritans", which counsels people contemplating suicide and which has increasing numbers of computer contacts, many of whom used the "re-mailer" service to remain anonymous.

102. On a less positive note, the anonymity which the Internet can bestow upon its users is often abused, creating distressing situations for the recipients of unwanted material. It is reported that a German professor in Munich was just one of many recipients of an e-mail in which the anonymous sender publicized that he had a large collection of pictures, videotapes, posters, audio recordings and games based on child pornography for sale. The sender also offered to buy any child pornography which others may have had available. It is believed that this offer was sent out to e-mail addresses all over the world. The recipient was shocked at what he read and posted the letter on the Internet, asking some of the questions that as yet cannot be answered: How did the sender get his address? To whom could he complain? How could he ensure that he never again received such electronic mail?

103. Proposals made during the seminar on racism and the Internet included the introduction of a system of mandatory signatures which would help in identifying the origin of messages on the Internet. A number of countries are looking at this type of system, the most likely being the establishment of a system of domain names which would have to be registered with a public authority. The system would be similar to having assigned telephone numbers. However, a user could conceivably forward a message to another site and send it from there, circumventing national laws and making it appear that the message came from another, innocent user.

104. At the seminar several non-governmental organizations, as well as the representative of the United States of America, urged caution with regard to restricting the use of anonymity on the Internet. In some countries, this anonymity is the only way to criticize the Government. If that anonymity is lost, Governments could trace dissidents and restrict their freedom of expression.

105. In the United States, the Supreme Court recently ruled that a federal law which sought to curb indecency on the Internet was unconstitutional. The plaintiffs, who had included various organizations and individuals associated with the computer and communications industries and those who publish or post materials on the Internet, challenged on constitutional grounds provisions of the Communications Decency Act of 1996 (CDA). They contended that the two challenged provisions of the CDA that were directed to communications over the Internet which might be deemed "indecent" or "patently offensive" for minors, defined as persons under the age of 18, infringed upon rights protected by the First Amendment to the Constitution and the Due Process Clause of the Fifth Amendment, in that adults would be denied access to materials which they had the right to see.

106. Singapore has attempted to regulate the content of the Internet as far as possible through a Class Licence Scheme, where Internet Service Providers (ISPs) and Internet Content Providers (ICPs) are required to block out objectionable sites as directed by the Singapore Broadcasting Authority. Schools, libraries and other ISPs which provide Internet access to children are required to institute a tighter level of control, although options as to

how this could be implemented have not yet been identified. The Special Rapporteur has learned that concerns have been expressed as to the scope and vagueness of the Internet Content Guidelines and the effect that they might have over the right to freedom of expression in Singapore.

107. In India, the Government has attempted to prevent misuse of the Internet by limiting access to the service to the academic world. As a result, the Internet remains inaccessible to the individual or commercial user. Similarly, the entry of foreign print and electronic media into the country has provoked a controversy, with the Government still undecided about its stand.

108. In Sweden, a Bill on Responsibility for Electronic Notice-Boards (proposition 1997/98:15) proposes that a new special law, to come into force on 1 May 1998, should be introduced regulating such responsibility. The law would not apply to providers of networks or other connections for the transmission of messages, but a provider would be obliged to give the users of his service information about his identity and to what extent incoming messages become available to other users. Providers would be obliged to remove or otherwise prevent continued dissemination of certain categories of message from their services, e.g. incitement to criminal acts, vilification of groups of people, child pornography or the unlawful depiction of violence. A provider would be sentenced to pay a fine if he intentionally or through negligence did not give this required information, or did not prevent further dissemination of a message belonging to these categories.

109. Providers of electronic notice-boards would not generally be obliged to screen all incoming messages, but if a provider is informed that he is assisting dissemination of these categories of criminal speech he would have to act to prevent further dissemination. Liability under the legislation is not strict. The provider must have knowledge of the content. This, however, raises the question of how an ISP can know whether material was legal or not, even if the ISP was aware of it being broadcast. It is difficult enough for a lawyer or a judge to decide, and an ISP will generally not have the legal background to make such decisions. It is impossible for a large server to scrutinize all transmissions.

E. Education as a catalyst

110. The Special Rapporteur has identified the role of education, whether formal or informal, as one of the key factors in the prevention of sexual exploitation of children, as well as in their rehabilitation. The recent International Conference against Child Labour, held, at the ministerial level, in Oslo, Norway, from 27 to 30 October 1997, concluded that education is a fundamental right of children and is now regarded as one of the key solutions in eliminating all forms of child labour, including commercial sexual exploitation. There seems to be a general consensus regarding how to fight commercial sexual exploitation of children, and especially on the importance of education.

111. The importance of education is not limited to children of school age. All sectors of society, whether very young, adolescent, adult or elderly, must

be empowered with knowledge of the realities of sexual abuse in order to protect themselves or others against it, or deal with the consequences of their attitudes and behaviour.

112. The first element of general teaching strategies is education that lays the foundation for better health, nutrition and income-earning capability. The principal asset of the poor, and their children, is their labour. Without education they will have to earn their money from jobs at the lowest grade, including prostitution. Educating the children of the poor greatly increases their chances of escaping this vicious circle.

113. It is evident that education programmes are also a cost-effective way of preventing sexual exploitation of children. With relatively limited resources, using already existing structures, a vast number of people can be reached with lasting consequences. If used together with the media, education can have even greater effect on whole communities and also policy makers.

1. Formal education

114. There is much, sometimes heated debate as to the age at which a child should first be taught how to protect itself from the abuse of others. Although the child's age and level of understanding must be considered when making a decision to empower him with this knowledge, the Special Rapporteur considers, in the light of having received allegations that even infants are sexually abused, that a child is never too young to be taught the difference between right and wrong patterns of behaviour of adults towards him or herself.

115. Formal sexual health education is an effective way of reaching children who are still in school and give them the necessary awareness and understanding to avoid being subjected to commercial sexual exploitation. It is, however, one aspect of education which has created controversy, in view of differing cultures and values. Some - though not all - religious communities are opposed to sexual health education. They present the argument that sexual health education leads to earlier sexual activity and to promiscuous behaviour and that it does not necessarily prevent the spread of sexually transmitted diseases. Promoters of sexual health education, on the other hand, claim that such education is one of the most important tools for raising awareness among the general public, as well as children, about the issues relating to sexual exploitation.

116. In some countries, opposition exists among representatives of religious groups and the authorities to conducting sex education programmes in schools or public education campaigns related to sexual behaviour. One method of overcoming this obstacle is to target education and training programmes at professionals working in strategic areas such as immigration and law enforcement. It should be mentioned that the Special Rapporteur has received information that, for example, in Germany, the Catholic Church cooperates very closely with and actively supports non-governmental organizations in their campaigns against child prostitution. The Special Rapporteur particularly welcomes the involvement of religious authorities, leaders and groups in the fight against commercial sexual exploitation of children since this could have

far-reaching positive effects on the target audience. At the same time, the Special Rapporteur reaffirms the importance of the preventive value of education related to sexual behaviour and reproductive rights.

117. In Chile, the Catholic Church has not opposed sex education in schools and such programmes have been conducted. In Peru, the Education Ministry has been developing sex education programmes. A commission of teachers, psychologists and representatives of the Catholic Church made notebooks with sex topics children usually asked about. The notebooks are different according to the age of the children.

118. The International Catholic Child Bureau (ICCB) reports that they have programmes for street children and children who have been involved in child prostitution in several countries in Asia, Africa and Latin America. The programmes involve both preventive education and rehabilitation. In Latin America particularly, ICCB plays a leading role in developing strategies for the prevention of sexual abuse and exploitation through its cooperation with other NGOs in the region.

2. Non-scholastic education

119. In some countries, up to 80 per cent of the population does not continue school beyond the primary level. It is vital that children who are outside the school system receive some form of sex education as it is these children who are at the greatest risk of being exploited. These children can be found living in rural areas, in urban slums, employed in factories, and may be refugees and migrants. Perhaps most vulnerable of all are street children. Some estimates suggest that there are as many as 100 million children and adolescents in the world who are working or living on the street, often in violent and dangerous situations.

120. In Kenya, the Child Welfare Society has started a programme that aims at rehabilitating and providing education and medical support for girls working and living on the streets. A shelter was also set up on the outskirts of Nairobi to provide these children with care until their reunification with their families or full integration into society was achieved. In, Peru the Faith and Joy (Fe y Alegria) Association provides education to 56,000 children, emphasizing practical life and work skills and environmental education.

121. In Canada, there are several programmes aimed at children who are involved in or are at risk of being lured into prostitution. Most of the programmes aim to contact and help children decide whether to return home or receive counselling, housing, education and employment. There are education programmes to teach young people how to become "streetwise". In Calgary, Alberta, there is a training programme called "High Heels and Teddy Bears" for teachers, social workers and others that explains the dynamics of child prostitution. Training programmes for parents trying to get their children off the street also exist in Calgary. In Winnipeg the police provide a "Guideline to Street-proofing Children" for parents. It includes a 24-point questionnaire to ascertain how parents communicate with their children and how aware children are of safe behaviours under a variety of circumstances, including how to deal with approaches of a sexual nature.

122. In Thailand, the Royal Thai Government has stepped-up its efforts to tackle the serious problem of child prostitution and child trafficking. The Government formulated a National Policy and Plan of Action for the Prevention and Eradication of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children. The northern regions of Thailand are well-known recruitment areas of young children. The Development and Education Programme for Daughters and Communities Centre (DEP) has been carrying out a preventive programme for girls at risk of being sent or recruited into prostitution, who are given temporary shelter and are enrolled in educational programmes. The programme provides skills training, non-formal education and leadership training. Issues such as social values and the development of self-esteem are also discussed. A local academic institution, the Rachapat Institute, is trying to strengthen cooperation between local NGOs and local government institutions. The Institute provides training to NGOs and local teachers to enable them to take action against child prostitution. The Special Rapporteur is very encouraged by the programmes in Thailand which aim to tackle child prostitution at the roots of the problem, at the local level. The programmes are enacted with the idea that if all sectors of the local community, including the children, are made aware of the problem and the dangers of prostitution through education, there is a fair chance of protecting even the children at greatest risk of being sold or trafficked for prostitution.

123. In Brazil, two projects are being implemented in Pernambucho and Bahia to prevent children from entering prostitution by providing them with formal education, vocational training and other activities. These programmes are being implemented by CNI (Confedederação Nacional da Industria) in cooperation with its member organizations. The programme includes training courses for local NGOs and local government officials responsible for education, health and law enforcement. In addition, awareness campaigns to put an end to child prostitution are in the process of being conducted through various media such as radio, television, posters and pamphlets. The Centro de Defesa da Criança e do Adolescente da Bahia (CEDECA/Ba) is producing a booklet on child sexual exploitation that is to be used as training material for institutions involved in the fight against child prostitution and trafficking in Brazil.

3. Informal education

124. Prevention of sexual exploitation of children must rest on more than just basic information given to children. There must be an emphasis on negotiating skills, building self-confidence, making the right decisions and resisting peer pressure. Information and education are also not enough; there must be a real effort to do something about the conditions these children live in. Attempts to change public attitudes also have to be made, since the stigmatization of children who have been subjected to commercial sexual exploitation is a serious obstacle to their rehabilitation and reintegration. The conclusion is that in order to get results, education and awareness-raising have to be given to all parts of the community. The participation of children in this process must not be forgotten.

125. Informal education can be used to reach a great number of people, raising their awareness of the subject and changing their attitudes. For this purpose television and radio are ideal media, radio perhaps being the medium which is able to reach the greatest number of people in developing countries.

126. In Nepal, songs have been used to raise the awareness of the problem of child trafficking in communities and especially among children. Songs on the trafficking of children were written, published and widely distributed. A musical play on the same subject was also staged in Kathmandu for three days. In addition, a radio drama about child prostitution and child labour was planned to be produced and broadcasted nationwide by Radio Nepal. In 1996 IPEC sponsored a case study on a community education project. The case study focused on certain aspects of community education programmes in the prevention of commercial sexual exploitation of children, namely, objectives, main components, strengths and weaknesses, key implementing actors, the role of children, policies and community mobilization.

127. In Mozambique, an Adolescent Girl Communication Initiative has been undertaken, similar to initiatives in 10 other countries in eastern and southern Africa. Educating adolescent girls and their parents about the importance of staying in school is one of the main messages. Other issues, such as sexual harassment, HIV/AIDS, early marriage, female genital mutilation and girls' domestic workload, are also brought up in this radio series. In addition, animated films, comic books, story books, audio cassettes, posters and guides have been developed. The multi-media effort is the result of months of collaboration among hundreds of writers, artists and researchers, and input from thousands of people in villages and cities.

128. In Thailand, the Thai Women of Tomorrow (TWT) have been active in conducting campaigns against prostitution. A video series and campaign modules comprising local documentaries illustrating the dangers and risks of prostitution were developed. A video series on career opportunities was also produced to be used by teachers in conducting campaigns among schoolgirls in the northern provinces of the country. The main aim was to change attitudes among girls towards their future careers so that they will not turn to prostitution as a means of earning income. A research and information centre on child prostitution is also being planned. The centre would provide information, networking and coordination, training in attitude change, education, as well as occupational and academic support.

129. The connection between child labour, including child prostitution, HIV/AIDS and the lack of education is evident. Recent studies carried out by the World Health Organization and the Joint United Nations Programme on AIDS (UNAIDS) suggest that sexual health education is an essential factor in combating HIV infection and other sexually transmitted diseases. Education of street children, the group of children most vulnerable to commercial sexual exploitation, is probably the best way of providing them with the necessary knowledge and alternative income-earning skills.

130. Different studies have also reached the conclusion that appropriate sexual health education can actually delay the start of sexual activity amongst adolescents. This evidence also suggests that adolescents who have received sexual health education are more likely to use contraceptives. A number of United Nations agencies, including UNICEF, UNHCR and UNESCO, are currently developing education policies as a means of fighting different forms of exploitation of children, including sexual exploitation.

131. UNAIDS has identified education as a main factor in reducing HIV/AIDS in children. Education needs to be given to both children and their families. UNAIDS has also recently updated an earlier WHO review of studies, mainly in Europe and North America, on the effect of sexual health education. The review showed that responsible and safe behaviour can be learned and that education on sexuality and/or HIV/AIDS does not encourage increased sexual activity. Quality programmes can in fact help delay the event of first intercourse and protect sexually active young people from sexually transmitted disease, including from HIV/AIDS, as well as from teenage pregnancies. Among other elements, quality programmes feature a clear explanation of the risks of unprotected sex and the methods, including abstinence, of reducing these risks, and help young people practise communication and negotiation skills.

132. There is also the question of how early the provision of HIV/AIDS-related information and sexual health education should begin. In this connection, the review found that sexual health education is best started before the onset of sexual activity. Such early education is believed by AIDS workers to be particularly important in developing countries, where secondary school enrolment is much lower than primary enrolment, especially for girls. In many countries, the majority of children have left the school by the age of 15. Reaching these children, many of whom are poor, illiterate and among the most vulnerable to HIV infection, quickly enough is arguably the highest AIDS prevention priority.

133. In Zimbabwe, school sex education starts at the age of eight or nine years. This seems very young, but according to AIDS workers there is increasing incidence of child sex abuse, including rape, which makes it very important to introduce the subject during that period and even earlier. It is important for the child to understand his or her own body and sexuality and how others may or may not touch him or her. The child should also be educated to know whom to turn to in case of difficulties.

134. In Australia, the first school-based Child Sexual Abuse Prevention Program has been implemented. It covers topics such as the human body, early warning signs and trust, "OK" and "not OK touching" and self-esteem.

135. In recognizing the important role children can play in protecting themselves, it is equally important to recognize the power that many people and institutional structures may have to prevent or allow children to access education, information and life-skills training. These "gatekeepers" may be parents, teachers, educators, community and religious leaders, media professionals, policy makers or government officials. Experience shows that when parents are provided with the facts concerning the advantages and disadvantages of sexual and health education, they generally agree on the need for such programmes. It is crucial to give these "gatekeepers" the relevant information and thus gain their cooperation in promoting early life-skills education and protection for children. This implies the need to provide HIV/AIDS and sexual health education also to adults.

136. Despite the fact that many countries have adopted laws, few include provisions defining the responsibilities of parents or legal guardians. Even though poverty and lack of educational opportunities are the primary causes of child labour, affordable education of good quality, relevant to the needs of

children and their families, is an attractive alternative even to the poorest of families. The attraction is increased if the link to improved employment prospects and higher income can be made.

137. It must also be noted that education can also have negative effects. It can be used to instil gender stereotypes and bias in children. For example, textbooks can transmit gender-stereotyped values and attitudes and portray women as weak and passive and in traditional roles as mothers and housewives. This kind of education leads to low self-esteem and makes girls more vulnerable to all forms of exploitation. General human rights education is an important factor in making children, both girls and boys, realize their own rights, as well as the rights of others. This leads to greater self-confidence, tolerance and respect for the principles of equality and non-discrimination.

4. Developments at the international level

138. ILO identifies prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation of children as a form of forced labour, which must not be tolerated anywhere. The proposed new ILO convention addresses child prostitution as one of the most intolerable forms of child labour. IPEC has engaged in the fight against child labour by helping countries create policies and engaging in local programmes that prevent children from being lured, coerced or trafficked into the sex trade, provide victims with rehabilitation, repatriation and reintegration, and mobilize public support against all forms of the practice.

139. UNICEF is currently considering how best to address the issue of sexual exploitation of children in its notes for school teachers series and on the "Voices for Youth" Website for children. UNICEF has also undertaken a number of training programmes targeted at professionals such as law-enforcement officials, medical professionals and social workers. Training programmes for the media have also been held.

140. In Bangladesh, the Government, assisted by UNICEF, is initiating support to 35 local NGOs active in a range of alternative programmes for working children, to use their experiences in an education programme for over 350,000 working children. In Belgium, the National Committee for UNICEF has encouraged the Ministry of Education to promote awareness-raising on sexual exploitation and abuse in schools through school curricula and education programmes. The National Committee also formed a working group with relevant partners where the development of prevention activities was the focus. In the Belgian French community, a public campaign focusing on article 34 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child was directed at raising awareness on the abuse and sexual exploitation of children. A training centre initiative for missing and exploited children has also been planned.

141. UNESCO supports actions to call attention to the problem of commercial sexual exploitation of children through its Street Children and Children in Distress programmes. It has developed a number of educational programmes for street children which include elements concerning both the child's right to be free from sexual abuse and the training of professionals in the work of

prevention and rehabilitation. In schools, UNESCO has been active in preventive education, and has encouraged ministries of education to include elements of sex and AIDS education into school curricula.

142. UNHCR has asked all its field offices to draw up a plan of action to indicate how they will address issues of sexual exploitation of children in the future. The UNHCR Executive Committee adopted Conclusion No. 73 (XLIV)-1993 on Refugee protection and sexual violence that draws attention to this problem. Among other things, it states that efforts must be made to develop and organize training courses for authorities, including camp officials, eligibility officers and others dealing with refugees, on practical protection measures for preventing and responding to sexual violence. Unaccompanied children and adolescents in particular are not often visible in legal procedures dealing with refugees and asylum seekers. This may increase their vulnerability to abuse and commercial exploitation.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

A. The media and education

143. It is hard to separate the catalysts of the media and education from each other. The Special Rapporteur believes that a combination of the most positive elements of each catalyst creates a strong forum for awareness-raising, with the goal of preventing abuses against children, sexual or otherwise, through informed advocacy. Listed below are some strategies which the Special Rapporteur urges Governments, in cooperation with civil society and non-governmental organizations, to adopt in their efforts to prevent and respond to commercial sexual exploitation of children, as well as to provide recovery and reintegration for child victims. In addition to the recommendations and strategies which the Special Rapporteur had already made in her last report to the General Assembly, and which could be applied to both the media and education as catalysts in the context of commercial sexual exploitation, the Special Rapporteur has outlined below further recommendations to be considered by Governments, non-governmental organizations and civil society, specifically related to the media and to education.

1. Prevention and advocacy

(a) Publicize and popularize laws for the protection of children against commercial sexual exploitation;

(b) Give prominent visibility to convictions of child sex offenders under those laws, to serve as a deterrent to potential perpetrators;

(c) Reallocate budgetary support to ensure the production and dissemination of children's books, magazines and papers, music, theatre and other artistic expressions for children, as well as child-oriented films and videos. Assistance through international cooperation should also support media and art for children;

(d) Provide free compulsory primary and secondary education for children;

(e) Mobilize the business sector to fund children's education, inter alia through grants or scholarships;

(f) Promote a culture of rights and positive moral values for society, especially addressing parents, children and members of their families;

(g) Sensitize and educate children to consciously detect and identify aberrant behaviour and risk factors or situations making them vulnerable to commercial sexual exploitation;

(h) Impart knowledge about the media, their impact and functioning in schools at all levels. Students should be enabled to relate to and use the media in a participatory manner, as well as to learn how to decode media messages, including in advertising. Share good experiences from different countries with other countries;

(i) Educate the public on the pernicious and long-lasting consequences of any form of sexual abuse and exploitation of children;

(j) Raise awareness among leaders of mass communications and entertainment industries with a view to sensitizing programmes and services to the needs of children and the protection of their rights;

(k) Encourage further discussion in newsrooms and within the media community as a whole through, inter alia, the drafting of specific guidelines by appropriate journalist bodies, in cooperation with human rights experts, on how to report on abuse of children and at the same time protect the dignity of the children involved;

(l) Assemble and evaluate experiences with respect to the introduction of voluntary ethical standards and mechanisms to encourage respect for them, including an analysis of the effectiveness of existing codes of conduct, professional guidelines, press councils, broadcasting councils, press ombudsmen and similar bodies;

(m) Conduct public information campaigns to encourage children victims or potential victims of sexual abuse to seek help and assistance and publicize offices and agencies extending such assistance;

(n) Sensitize policy makers, legislators, civic and professional groups and religious leaders and communities to not only the desirability but the absolute necessity of including sex education in school curricula; sex education, including HIV/AIDS awareness-raising, is necessary at an early age so that children fully comprehend their responsibilities and the consequences of their sexual behaviour, for their health and their future;

(o) Train teachers to carry out sexual health education programmes in schools;

(p) Establish a monitoring body, composed of, inter alia, child psychologists and social welfare officers, to approve programmes and

initiatives intended to protect and assist children victims of sexual abuse and exploitation so as to ascertain that such programmes do not carry any unintended or unforeseen negative repercussions on children;

(q) Consult with manufacturers of computer hardware and software products, Internet service providers, legislators, parents and children themselves to develop strategies for minimizing the dangers of the Internet being used for purposes of commercial sexual exploitation of children;

(r) Explore constructive agreements with media companies to protect children against harmful influences. Gather facts about various attempts at voluntary agreements with media companies on positive measures such as not broadcasting violent programmes during certain hours and making a clear presentation before programmes about their content, and the development of technical devices such as "V-chips" to help consumers block out certain types of programmes.

2. Response and intervention

144. Media and education do not only play crucial roles in preventing commercial sexual exploitation of children but also have a tremendous capacity and a certain responsibility to provide response mechanisms to children victims, as well as to intervene, in an informed manner, in cases of sexual abuse of children that come to their attention. The following recommendations are, therefore, addressed to all persons involved in the media and education sectors, in responding to a child's cry for help:

(a) Widely publicize mechanisms for reporting crimes against children;

(b) Widely publicize existing response mechanisms, organizations and agencies providing assistance to children victims, such as telephone hotlines, focal points in relevant government departments and in educational institutions, and local communities;

(c) Sensitize media and educational personnel to the dangers of revictimization of children victims and provide safeguards for avoiding such dangers;

(d) Design and implement training programmes for all sectors of society involved with children, such as teachers, parents, social workers, law-enforcement officers and other carers for children, with a view to:

(i) Early detection of signs of physical or sexual abuse;

(ii) Interviewing and confidence-building techniques in dealing with children victims of abuse;

(iii) Sensitization to avoid revictimization;

(e) Ensure informed and sensitive reporting of cases of child sex abuse, in particular protecting the identity, dignity and integrity of the victim;

(f) Sensitize the public to the needs of a child victim of sexual abuse and exploitation so as to avoid ostracism, further revictimization or unfair punishment;

(g) "Break the silence" by encouraging the public to inform relevant authorities of any suspicious activities potentially endangering children, thereby extending valuable assistance in detecting and apprehending child sex abusers;

(h) Reinforce and foster concepts of community responsibility and accountability in protecting and assisting children and their families;

(i) Mobilize the private sector, including computer industries, in the fight against the commercial sexual exploitation of children through, inter alia, making available hotlines to enable users to report potentially harmful materials on the Internet in an effort to promote self-regulatory controls.

3. Recovery and reintegration

145. Under article 39 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, a child victim of any form of exploitation or abuse shall receive all appropriate treatment and care to promote his or her physical and psychological recovery and social reintegration, in an environment which fosters the health, self-respect and dignity of the child. It is thus clear that assistance to a child victim does not end with a response to the cry for help by removing the child from an abusive situation or by eliminating the cause of abuse. Such important intervention, some strategies for which are outlined above, must be followed by serious efforts to establish a healing process to redress damage already done. Some recommendations intended to further the recovery and the reintegration into society of child victims are outlined below:

(a) Ensure that all rehabilitation and reintegration programmes and initiatives are professionally evaluated by child psychologists, child psychiatrists or other qualified persons or organizations, with a view to maximizing the benefits for children victims and eliminating any potential harmful effects; monitor periodically the implementation of such programmes and initiatives to ensure that children receive appropriate and informed assistance and care;

(b) Mobilize and involve the business sector in focusing on the plight of economically disadvantaged children with a view to taking proactive initiatives, such as providing children victims of sexual exploitation, prostitution and pornography with alternative income-generating activities, apprenticeships or livelihood training possibilities;

(c) Increase efforts to reach out to children who have dropped out of the school system and are at high risk of being exploited sexually or otherwise. These children should be provided with shelter and education as a means of giving them an alternative to life on the streets;

(d) Provide free counselling services for child victims and their families to ensure reintegration of the children within their families and their communities;

(e) Enlist the cooperation of teachers and other children victims to facilitate the return of child victims to school, bearing in mind the right to privacy and integrity of the child.

B. Networking between governmental and non-governmental organizations

146. As the Special Rapporteur emphasized in her report to the General Assembly, active and effective cooperation not only between Governments and non-governmental organizations but also between non-governmental organizations themselves is imperative in the fight against sexual abuse and exploitation of children. The Special Rapporteur appreciates the fact that in many countries increased cooperative efforts are already being extended in the promotion and protection of the rights of children by both Governments and non-governmental organizations. The Special Rapporteur, however, cannot but fail to note that the effective identification and allocation of areas of responsibility and accountability, without competition and at the national level, are yet to be put into place. Most initiatives and programmes which the Special Rapporteur has been able to observe function on an ad hoc basis, without any coordination relating to networking or tapping of sources of funding. The Special Rapporteur strongly believes that close cooperation and openness in sharing information and experiences in protecting the rights of children would mutually strengthen the capacities and successes of each organization, both governmental and non-governmental.

147. Some obstacles to effective networking have been observed, as follows:

(a) Organizations, both governmental and non-governmental, frequently embark on projects which are too far-reaching or all-encompassing to be effective;

(b) A lack of coordination, often already at the fund-seeking stage, leads to duplication and overlap of activities in one sector, thereby neglecting other important areas for providing support to children;

(c) Competition for funding sources often leads to competition and secrecy among organizations;

(d) There exists no accountability for non-implementation.

148. While the Special Rapporteur recognizes that full networking is not feasible in all circumstances, she firmly believes that such active and effective cooperation would not only ensure that comprehensive support is provided to children in all areas, from prevention to reintegration, but would also considerably strengthen the individual organizations working towards this common objective. Some recommendations to this end are put forward below:

(a) Funding agencies and donors should ensure a willingness to fund projects and initiatives in all areas of protecting and promoting the rights of the child in order to maximize support to children;

(b) Funding agencies and donors should carefully evaluate the proposed programmes against the national context and also in the framework of activities already undertaken in related areas;

(c) Consultative meetings between Governments, funding agencies and non-governmental organizations should be held to devise a strategy for effective networking, including the development of a directory of organizations working in the area of children, with descriptions of their specific areas of activities and responsibilities;

(d) Within the United Nations system, such cooperation and coordination to ensure maximization of resources for the benefit of children is also called for.

Notes

1/ The Daily Telegraph, 4 November 1997, London.

2/ The Daily Telegraph, 6 May 1997, London.

3/ The Times, 26 July 1997, London.

4/ UNICEF estimate contained in the electronic network "Street Kid List".

5/ The Daily Telegraph, 6 November 1997, London.

6/ Reuters press release, 29 July 1997.

7/ The Daily Telegraph, 8 November 1997, London.

8/ Information supplied by ECPAT.

9/ Ibid.

10/ International Herald Tribune, 23 September 1997.